

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Be it remembered that the Oxford Historic Preservation Commission did meet in regular session on Tuesday, April 13, 2010 at 5:30 p.m. in the City Hall courtroom with the following members present:

Jeff Asti, Chairman  
Kevin Frye  
Jack McKenzie  
Julie K. Spears  
Molissia Swaney  
Shawn Telford

Randy Barber, Building Official  
Katrina Hourin, Assistant City Planner  
Tiffany Smith, Historic Preservation Consultant  
Alicia Thompson, Secretary

The following Commissioners were absent:

Campbell Best  
Harry Owens  
Sonia Weinburg Thompson

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Asti.

After the meeting was called to order, the following business was transacted:

### **Approval of the Agenda**

Chairman Asti asked if there were any changes to the agenda. There being no changes made to the agenda, motion was made by Commissioner Frye and seconded by Commissioner Swaney to approve the agenda.

All present voting aye.

The motion was approved and the agenda was accepted.

### **Approval of the Minutes from the March 9, 2010 Meeting**

The following modification was made to the minutes from the March 9, 2010 meeting: delete the erroneous listing of Commissioner Camp Best's name from the roll of present members.

There being no further changes, motion was made by Commissioner McKenzie and seconded by Commissioner Swaney to approve the minutes from the March 9, 2010 meeting.

All present voting aye.

The motion was approved.

### REGULAR AGENDA

**Public Hearing for Initial Review Section of the Demolition by Neglect procedure for property located at 1701 Jackson Avenue.** Chairman Asti informed the Commission that correspondence had been received from the City Building Official, Randy Barber regarding the findings on the condition of property located at 1701 Jackson Avenue, Oxford, Mississippi. Chairman Asti informed the Commission that property owner John Shaw responded to the correspondence on April 13, 2010 by stating that he would be unable to attend the meeting due to business obligations. Commissioner Asti added that Mr. Shaw's correspondence stated that Ken Ash and Ann Fair would represent him in the discussion. At that point in the hearing, Ken Ash came before the Commission representing John Shaw to discuss the three items that were included in the March 11, 2010 correspondence sent by the City of Oxford. The items that were mentioned included:

- A) Commence work on repairs,
- B) Provide a plan for commencement of repairs and, if necessary, request an extension of time, or
- C) Provide an inspection report from a licensed professional stating that the property is not in a state of deterioration or neglect.

Chairman Asti then stated that the Commission had not received any information from Mr. Shaw or a licensed professional denying deterioration of the property. Chairman Asti then read the correspondence that was forwarded to Mr. Shaw by the City Building Official Randy Barber on March 2, 2010. The letter addressed the following conditions:

1. **Balcony:** *Deterioration of the balcony has led to disrepair and rotting in all structural members. The roof of the balcony has holes in the decking which lead to rotting in the rafters. Exposure to weather has led to deterioration in the cornice and also the band which holds the second floor. Beams and floor joists have lost structural integrity because of water damage causing the floor to break away from the house.*
2. **Chimney:** *Further inspection of the house revealed a large hole on the exterior of the chimney which is causing deterioration. Water enters the house and has damaged the interior of the structure, including the floors walls and ceilings. Repair of the chimney is necessary to prevent further damage to joists, beams and rafters.*
3. **Windows:** *Minimal maintenance has led to rotting of the window sashes and window frames in many rooms of the house. They are in need of replacement to become operable.*

Chairman Asti asked Mr. Ash if there was a plan to repair or replace the balcony. Mr. Ash replied that the balcony has been braced and that the homeowner feels that it is safe since it has been braced. Mr. Ash further stated that the balcony could be repaired, but the repairs would be expensive. Mr. Ash stated that there were not any current plans to repair or replace the balcony. Commissioner Swaney asked Mr. Ash if the balcony would continue to deteriorate if the repairs were not made. Mr. Ash stated that the balcony is unsafe in its current condition. Further discussion was made between Commissioner Swaney and Mr. Ash about the condition of the porch and the balcony.

Chairman Asti asked Mr. Ash if there was a plan to repair or replace the chimney. Mr. Ash replied that the chimney currently has dead mortar which is causing the bricks to fall out. Mr. Ash also stated that the chimney needs to be reconstructed from the ground up. Mr. Ash also stated that if the chimney were reconstructed it would only be for aesthetics. Further discussion was made between Mr. Ash and the Commission regarding the condition of the chimney. Mr. Ash informed the Commission that the chimney is currently covered with a tarp and that there is a plan in the works for an estimate to remove the chimney.

Chairman Asti asked Mr. Ash if there was a plan to repair or replace the windows. Discussion was made between Mr. Ash and the Commission about repairing the windows. Mr. Ash informed the Commission that the applicant would like to repair some of the windows and replace the windows on the east side. Commissioner Frye asked Mr. Ash if the repairs would be a temporary fix. Mr. Ash replied that some of the windows could be fixed with caulk. Chairman Asti asked Mr. Ash if Mr. Shaw had authorized him to repair the windows. Mr. Ash replied that Mr. Shaw had authorized him to make repairs to the windows.

Discussion was also made between Mr. Ash and the Commission about the condition of the roof in the rear of the structure. Mr. Ash explained to the Commission that the least expensive way to repair the roof would be to recover the existing roof. Chairman Asti asked Mr. Ash what the square footage of the roofing was. Mr. Ash replied that it was probably 1000 – 1200 square feet and presented the Commission with three samples of possible roofing materials. Commissioner Frye posed a question to the Commission asking if the discussion on the roof was a matter that needed a Certificate of Appropriateness. Commissioner Frye also posed a question to the Commission asking if the correspondence from the City Building Official included language that discussed the condition of the roof. It was determined that the correspondence did not include language discussing the condition of the roof.

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner Frye and seconded by Commissioner McKenzie to table a decision on the proposed repairs to the roof until a later date.

All present voting aye.

The motion was approved.

Chairman Asti informed the Commission that it needed to discuss the March 2, 2010 correspondence to John Shaw from City Building Official Randy Barber and make a determination on demolition by neglect per Section 54-30 of the City of Oxford's Historic Preservation Ordinance. Commissioner Frye reiterated that there were three primary areas of concern noted on the correspondence. Commissioner Frye also noted that Ken Ash had addressed those three areas by noting the following:

1. **Balcony:** *There is currently no plan of repair.*
2. **Chimney:** *There is currently no plan of repair.*
3. **Windows:** *There is currently a plan of repair in place.*

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner Frye and seconded by Commissioner Spears to determine that there is evidence of demolition by neglect to the balcony and chimney on the current structure per Section 54-30 of the City of Oxford's Historic Preservation Ordinance located at 1701 Jackson Avenue, Oxford, Mississippi.

All present voting aye.

The motion was approved.

Chairman Asti informed Mr. Ash that the Commission will issue further findings from the City of Oxford to property owner John Shaw. Chairman Asti also informed Mr. Ash that the roof would be considered separately and that the property owner would need to submit an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed repairs to the roof.

**Public Hearing for Case #100A – 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street.** Edye Conkerton of Eco Architecture, PLLC came before the Commission representing George Haymans of Agrivest, LLC seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing residential structure on property located at 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street, Oxford, Mississippi. Ms. Conkerton presented the Commission with additional documentation in the form of a massing study for the current structure and a massing study of the homes located within the neighborhood. Ms. Conkerton informed the Commission that the applicant was seeking to demolish the current structure and construct a new one and one half (1½) story structure in its place. Ms. Conkerton further added that the applicant's original plan was to retain the current structure and construct two new residences in the rear of the property, however that plan was modified after it was determined that the current structure had been badly neglected by the previous property owner. Discussion was made regarding the applicant's request. Chairman Asti informed the Commission that it should vote on the appropriateness of the structure as noted in Section 54-26(4) of the City of Oxford's Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding demolitions. Commissioner Spears offered comments stating that in her opinion the structure was not historically significant. Commissioner Spears added that the structure did not contain any character defining elements or materials nor was there any historical event tied to the structure.

George Haymans provided the Commission with a property value spreadsheet (Exhibit E) and gave letters supporting the demo from the surrounding neighbors (Exhibit G). Mr. Haymans also

provided the Commission with an estimate from Massey Construction comparing the cost of renovation to the cost of demolishing the current structure and constructing a new one. Mr. Haymans stated that the figures for renovation were \$352,000 versus \$235,790 for demolition and new construction. Mr. Haymans further stated that he had spoken with several reputable contractors and Massey Construction was the only company that was comfortable in providing him with a quote to renovate the structure. Lengthy discussion and debate was made between Mr. Haymans and the Commission regarding the proposed demolition.

Chairman Asti added that he respected Commissioner Spears' opinion, but he argued that the structure's features are distinctive even though they might not be individually distinctive. Chairman Asti also reminded the applicant that the features don't have to qualify in order for a structure to be in the historic district. Commissioner Swaney added that she agreed with Chairman Asti that the structure is distinctive and adds to the character of the neighborhood that it is located in. Ms. Conkerton argued that consideration should be given to the sustainability of the district and stated that the structure is an economic waste in its current state. Further debate was made between Ms. Conkerton and Commissioner Swaney regarding the significance of the structure to the neighborhood. Chairman Asti added that the structure has been criminally neglected and cautioned the Commission to figure out a practical solution. After further discussion was made, Chairman Asti asked for a motion on the applicant's request.

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner McKenzie and seconded by Commissioner Spears to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing residential structure per Section 54-26(4) of the City of Oxford's Historic Preservation Ordinance on property located at 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street, Oxford, Mississippi.

The vote was as follows:

Asti	Aye	Frye	Abstained
McKenzie	Aye	Swaney	Nay
Spears	Aye		
Telford	Aye		

The motion was approved.

**Public Hearing for Case #100B – 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street.** Edye Conkerton of Eco Architecture, PLLC came before the Commission representing George Haymans and Agrivest, LLC seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new one and one half (1½) story residential structure (Building 1) located at 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street, Oxford, Mississippi. Ms. Conkerton explained the applicant's request and presented a massing study, photographs, elevations and a floor plan for Building 1. Ms. Conkerton added that the original plan was to construct a two story residence but that plan was modified to construct a one and one half (1½) structure due to some Commissioners' concerns that a two story structure would appear too imposing. Discussion was made regarding the modifications and Commissioner Spears commended the applicant on successfully breaking up the massing of the structure. Historic Preservation Consultant Tiffany Smith asked Ms. Conkerton about the type of materials to be

used for the project. Ms. Conkerton provided the Commission with a materials list and explained the materials to be used in the project. Ms. Conkerton also added that the landscaping plan was the same as the previously submitted plan. Discussion was made between Ms. Conkerton and the Commission regarding the applicant's request.

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner Frye and seconded by Commissioner McKenzie to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new one and one half (1½) story residential structure (Building 1) located at 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street, Oxford, Mississippi.

The vote was as follows:

Asti	Aye	Swaney	Abstained
Frey	Aye	McKenzie	Aye
Spears	Aye	Telford	Aye

The motion was approved.

**Public Hearing for Case #102 – 1339 Pierce Avenue.** Edey Conkerton of Eco Architecture, PLLC came before the Commission representing George Haymans and Blackacre Properties, LLC seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to make exterior renovations to property located at 1339 Pierce Avenue, Oxford, Mississippi. Ms. Conkerton presented the Commission with photographs, elevations, a floor plan, and a materials list for the proposed project. Ms. Conkerton also explained that the applicant's proposal included renovations to the porches, adding Hardiboard siding, removal of the existing roofline and replacing it with a higher pitched gabled roof and the addition of a rear porch over the rear parking. Ms. Conkerton also explained that the existing brick veneer would have a *slurry coat* added over it to resemble a painted look. Commissioner McKenzie asked Ms. Conkerton was she meant by *slurry coat* over the brick. Ms. Conkerton explained that it was a thick coating put over brick that resembled stucco. Chairman Asti informed Ms. Conkerton that her current proposal appeared to completely alter the façade of the existing structure. Discussion was made between Ms. Conkerton and the Commission regarding proposed changes to the front façade of the current structure. Commissioner Spears stated that she would like to see the structure's front picture window remain intact. Other Commissioners also stated that they would like to see the structure's front picture remain. Further discussion was made regarding the front picture window and Ms. Smith asked Ms. Conkerton if she could sketch in the front picture window as an addendum to her application. Ms. Conkerton sketched in the front picture window as an addendum to her application and further discussion was made regarding the windows. Mr. Haymans commented on the landscaping plan and added that no trees would be removed from the site. Further discussion was made regarding the applicant's request.

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner Frye and seconded by Commissioner McKenzie to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a one and one half (1½) story structure with an addendum to the front picture window on property located at 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street, Oxford, Mississippi.

All present voting aye.

The motion was approved.

Ms. Conkerton informed the Commission that she was also seeking to modify the plan to allow for an alternate door than the one previously submitted. Discussion was regarding the type of alternate door to be used in the project.

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner Frye and seconded by Commissioner McKenzie to modify the plan to allow for an alternate door than the one previously submitted for Case #102.

All present voting aye.

The motion was approved.

**Public Hearing for Case #103 – 1222 Buchanan Avenue.** *(Prior to the hearing, Commissioner McKenzie recused himself)* Ernest Lowe came before the Commission seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a picket fence to coordinate with a previously approved picket fence on property located at 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street, Oxford, Mississippi. Mr. Lowe informed the Commission that he was seeking approval to install a picket fence on the west side property line that would coordinate with the previously approved fence. Discussion was made regarding the previously approved fence.

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner Frye and seconded by Commissioner Spears to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a picket fence to coordinate with a previously approved picket fence on property located at 1209 South 16<sup>th</sup> Street, Oxford, Mississippi.

All present voting aye.

The motion was approved.

**Preliminary Conference – 1013 Jefferson Avenue.** Jeff Williams of Williams Engineering came before the Commission representing Seeker Properties, LLC seeking preliminary review for a proposed 26 room 3 story boutique hotel. Mr. Williams presented the Commission with a site plan and elevations and informed the Commission that he was seeking their feedback on the proposed project. Discussion was made between Mr. Williams and the Commission regarding the site plan and elevations. Mr. Williams also presented the Commission with a combination layout for the hotel and parking lot to be located across the street from the hotel. Discussion was made regarding the proposed parking lot. Mr. Williams also informed the Commission that the proposal still has to meet the City's landscaping requirements and discussion was made regarding the proposed landscaping plan and landscape buffer. Discussion was also made regarding the materials list, height, and massing of the proposed project. Further discussion was regarding the setback of the proposed project.

There being no further questions or comments from the public or the Commission no action was taken.

**There being no further business to come before the Commission, motion was made by Commissioner Spears and seconded by Commissioner McKenzie to adjourn the meeting.**

All present voted aye.

The meeting was adjourned.